

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

OLAM WEST COAST, INC.  
Petitioner

v.

CALIFORNIA FIRE-ROASTED, L.L.C.  
Patent Owner

U.S. Patent No. 6,099,882

Filing Date: June 7, 1999

Issue Date: August 8, 2000

Title: Method and Apparatus for Roasting and Smoking Skinned Food Products

---

*Inter Partes* Review No.: (Unassigned)

---

**DECLARATION OF DR. T. KIM PARNELL**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION .....	1
A. Background and Qualifications .....	1
B. Information Considered .....	3
II. LEGAL STANDARDS .....	5
A. Legal Standards for Prior Art .....	5
B. Legal Standards for Obviousness .....	6
III. OVERVIEW OF THE '882 PATENT .....	10
A. Summary of the '882 Patent and Relevant Technology .....	10
B. Prosecution History of the '882 Patent .....	13
C. Prosecution History of Ex Parte Re-Examination .....	14
D. Person of Ordinary Skill in the Art .....	16
E. Claim Construction .....	16
1. “skinned food product” .....	17
2. “leaving said skinned food product at least partially uncooked” .....	18
3. “leaving said tomato at least partially uncooked” .....	19
4. “roasting unit” .....	20
IV. THE PRIOR ART .....	20
A. Grounds 1-3: Claims 1-17 and 36-43 Are Obvious Under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) (pre-AIA) over Magnuson in view of Marra, Magnuson in view of Hershfeld, or Magnuson in view of Fessman .....	20
1. Summary of Magnuson .....	20
2. Summary of Marra .....	22
3. Summary of Hershfeld .....	23
4. Summary of Fessman .....	24
5. Detailed Analysis .....	24